Volume 1, Issue 1, Page 41-56

Diplomacy of Pakistan during the Era of Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto

Summer Sultana
Department of Political Science
University of Karachi

Bashir Ahmed Kalwar
Area Study Centre for Europe
University of Karachi

Muhammad Ali Junaid
Department of Political Science
University of Karachi

Abstract

This study discusses the Nature of International Relations and Diplomacy of Islamic Republic of Pakistan During two reigns of Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto (from 1988-1990 and 1993-1996) respectively. It also elaborates the Post Government and pre-Death life of Benazir Bhutto. She was demonized by the civil-military oligarchy that has virtually run Pakistan since 1958, the year of Pakistan's first military coup. But she retained a hard core of popular support, and her social democratic Pakistan People's Party is widely regarded as Pakistan's largest political party. In 1988, at the age of 35, Bhutto became the youngest prime minister in Pakistan's troubled history, and the first woman to lead a Muslim nation in the modern age. Moreover, this paper explains the relations with United States of America and general Zia's foreign policy despite having strong opposition due to his direct involvement in the hanging of her father. It will examine the policies regarding neighboring countries like Afghanistan and India, in Addition with to End War in Afghanistan. This study will enhance the raise of Women Status in South Asia Especially and women of the World Generally. This research also highlights the thinking of Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto regarding the state of Pakistan in connection with the modern world.

Keywords: Benazir Bhutto, Pakistan, Diplomacy, International Relations, Democracy, Human Rights

تلخیص

اس مقالے میں شہید محترمہ بینظیر بھٹو کی حکومت کے دونوں ادوار (۱۹۸۸ تا۱۹۹۰ اور۱۹۹۳ تا۱۹۹٦) میں اسلامی جمہوریہ پاکستان کے بین الاقوامی تعلقات اور سفارتکاری کی نوعیت کے بارے میں بات کی گئی ہے۔ اس مقالے میں بینظیر بھٹو کی حکومت کے بعد اور شہادت سے پہلے کی زندگی کی وضاحت کی گئی ہے۔ وہ سول فوجی طبقہ اشرافیہ (نوکر شاہی) کی اور جمہوریت کی منافی طاقتوں سے خوف زدہ تھیں۔ جس نے۱۹۵۸ سے پاکستان میں فوجی بغاوت کی حمایت کی۔ لیکن انہوں نے اس کے باوجود عوامی حمایت حاصل کی ، اور ان کی

جمہوری پاکستان پیپلز پارٹی وسیع پیمانے پر پاکستان کی سب سے بڑی سیاسی جماعت کے طور پر عوامی حمایت حاصل کرنے میں کامیاب ہوئی۔ شہید محترمہ بینظیر بھٹو۱۹۸۸میں ،۳۵سال کی عمر میں ، پاکستان کی مشکلات زدہ تاریخ کی سب سے کم عمر وزیر اعظم ، اور جدید دور میں مسلمان قوم کی رہنمائی کرنے والی پہلی خاتون بنیں۔ علاوہ ازیں ، یہ مقالہ متحدہ امریکہ اور جنرل ضیاء کی خارجہ پالیسی کے ساتھ ان کے تعلقات کی وضاحت کرتا ہے۔ باوجود اس کے وہ ان کے والد کی پھانسی میں براہ راست ملوث تھے۔ یہ مقالہ مزید پڑوسی ممالک جیسے افغانستان اور ہندوستان کے بارے میں پالیسیوں اور اس کے ساتھ ساتھ افغانستا ن میں جنگ کے خاتمے کا بھی جائزہ لے گا۔ اس مقالے سے جنوبی ایشیاء میں خصوصاً اور دنیا میں عموماً خواتین کی حیثیت میں اضافہ ہوگا۔ اس تحقیق میں جدید دنیا کے سامنےمحترمہ بینظیر بھٹو کی ریاست پاکستان کے حوالے سے سوچ کو بھی اجاگر کیا گیا ہے۔

کلیدی الفاظ: بینظر بھٹو، پاکستان، سفارتکاری، بین القوامی تعلقات، جمہوریت، انسانی حقوق

Introduction

As much as a concern to the Diplomacy and International relations are concerned, one should deem that they are sometimes used synonymously and interchangeably in the lingual and textual way.

As we see that:

(a) International relations seem like the management of communication and relationships between nations by members and employees of each nation's government. But on the other hand, Foreign policy is frequently understood as a:

(b) Skill in international dealings: skill in managing communication and relationships between nations and on the other direction of the synonymous way diplomacy is also seen as a:

(c) Tact: skill and tact in dealing with other people.[1]

As much as a concern to the Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto Shaheed and her two respective governments are concerned they don't need any introduction. The matter to discuss and elaboration is the nature of international relations and diplomacy of Islamic Republic of Pakistan during her two reigns (1988-1990 and 1993-1996) respectively and Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto's post government and pre-death life.

Benazir had few issues while tackling foreign relations for the betterment of the Islamic Republic of Pakistan beforehand.

A) To continue relations with United States of America despite having impression that her father death had any back ground conspiracy maintained by USA.

[1]Encarta English Dictionary.CD. Edition.2102. Key word: Diplomacy.

B)To continue General Zia foreign Policy despite having strong opposition due to his direct involvement in the hanging of his father.
C) To tackle Afghan Policy in addition with to end war in Afghanistan.
D)To raise the women status of female of South Asia especially and women of the world generally.
E) To moderate and secularize the state of Pakistan in connection with modern world.
F) To normalize the relations with India.
G) To make democracy as the focal point of her diplomacy abroad.

Here neither we have sufficient time nor we have space that we may address each and every above-mentioned issue respectively hence each and every above-mentioned issue deserves an applied research paper to be write down.

But we will try our best to focus over the essential point to address. Below we will see how her family and world see through their lens of wisdom:

1. Her Son Bilawal Bhutto Zardari wrote a forward for a book that:
"For those in my country who would find it easier to walk away from democracy and seek revenge through violence, I urge you to remember my mother's words: democracy is the sweetest revenge. To plunge the country into more violence and chaos would only play into the hands of those who hope for democracy's failure. The terrorists have no use for democracy, and the current government fears it. We must unite and rise above both.

And to those outside of my country, who support our fight for democracy, I urge you to consider this: We cannot oppose one form of tyranny while turning a blind eye to another. Together, we must stand against the violence of the terrorists on the one hand, while standing equally firm against the regime's use of it as an excuse to impose their own repressive will upon the people of Pakistan.

The regime has made a mockery of our constitution. The world watched in disbelief as the regime declared emergency rule and sent troops into the streets in November– not because of a terrorist threat to the government, but a constitutional threat to their autocratic grip on power. The men they threw into jails were not terrorists but Supreme Court judges and respected lawyers. The newspapers they intimidated were not organs of terrorists but of free and independent citizens of Pakistan.

My mother stood bravely against both the tyranny of terrorism as well as the tyranny of dictatorship. She has been martyred for her courage and pursuit of freedom, but now that courage and pursuit has been bequeathed to the people of Pakistan. We shall carry on. It will take the kind of courage my mother showed. It will take courage among her loyal followers to calm their anger and renounce violence or revenge. We must instead demand fair and open

elections, free of government intimidation and then make our show of force on Election Day."[2]

2. Gordon Brown: The British PM said that:
As we reflect on Benazir Bhutto's achievement as the first elected female leader of a Muslim nation, we must also recognize that a society that allows women's voices to be heard is more likely to be a society of tolerance and compassion where violence has no place. It should also be a part of her legacy that women are empowered to play their full part in Pakistan's democracy:

Pakistan's society will be stronger for it. Benazir Bhutto may have been killed by terrorists, but the terrorists must not live to allow filling democracy in Pakistan. Pakistan is a resilient country, its people committed to a democratic, tolerant vision of society. This atrocity will strengthen our resolve that terrorists will not win in Pakistan, in the UK, or anywhere else in the world.

A strong, representative democracy in Pakistan will defeat terrorism and extremism, show the path to more stable, prosperous future, and stand as a lasting memorial to the life work of Benazir Bhutto, we are it to her memory to strive together to achieve that goal."[3]

She secured the freedom of so many when she first came to power but upon losing it, she saw her own husband locked behind bars Tales were spun, myths created and conspiracies hatched in the dark, dirty corners of sickened minds. Like mettle myths are frequently recycled – the daughter of the East had to go. But they had not mastered the art of vanquishing her.[4]

3. Victoria Schofield commented on her politico governmental carrier by praising that:
"When her father has executed the following April, what she hoped would be only a temporary position, standing in for him as leader of the Pakistan People's Party, became a permanent one.

It was to be a long struggle. General Zia al-Haq, the military leader who had overthrown and executed her father, was entrenched as president of Pakistan. After the Soviet Union invaded neighboring Afghanistan in 1979, he enjoyed the backing of the West. His death in a plane crash in 1988 opened the way for her to stand in national elections.

When she became prime minister, it seemed that she had been able to step into her father's shoes to continue his work. As a liberal Western woman and believer in the political process

[2]Panhwar Sani Hussain (ED) Articles Written to Pay Tribute to Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto. Panhwar.pp:9,10: January:6.2008.
[3]Panhwar Sani Hussain (ED). Democracy must be Benazir Bhutto's lasting memorial.by. Gordon Brown December 31, 2007.pp:13-14.
[4] Islam, Tariq Islam. Not having lived in vain. Daily Dawn.Khi. January 1, 2008.

something she had imbibed during her education at Harvard and Oxford she genuinely believed that she could make a difference."[5]

If seeing all these praising columns we may note that all agree that she always tried to promote democratic regime and liberal, Secular and moderated perspective and these traits always may be found beneath her Foreign policy during her two respective governments.

She was demonized by the civil-military oligarchy that has virtually run Pakistan since 1958, the year of Pakistan's first military coup. But she retained a hard core of popular support, and her social democratic Pakistan People's Party is widely regarded as Pakistan's largest political party. In 1988, at the age of 35, Bhutto became the youngest prime minister in Pakistan's troubled history, and the first woman to lead a Muslim nation in the modern age.

For her supporters, she stood for women's empowerment, human rights and mass education. Her detractors accused her of many things from corruption to being too close to the U.S. During her second tenure as prime minister, Pakistan became one of the 10 emerging capital markets of the world. The World Health Organization praised government efforts in the field of health.[6]

4. We see Michelle Hillen praising Benazir for her contribution to the terrorism eliminating efforts by saying that:

Bill Vickery, a Little Rock political consultant who met Bhutto through Wallace, said he tried to help her garner support in the U.S. for her efforts. Her death, Vickery said, is a "complete and total disaster for both Pakistan and the United States."

"The one key figure in the war on terror could have been Benazir Bhutto," he said. "She would have possessed the public approval and the confidence of the U.S. government to go after al-Qaida and the Taliban, and she professed that she would do that. Ultimately, that may have cost her her life." Wallace said though Bhutto would want the elections to go on in Pakistan, he doesn't know who will be able to fill the void she has left there.

"You have al-Qaida operating right there, funded and trained right there," Wallace said. "Here was a leader that wanted to come in and change that and stand by us and the people of America for justice and democracy. We have lost that. There is no one else there that could do that."[7]

One may note that all the above-mentioned writings and statement are unanimous regarding her contribution about democracy as her genuine tool of polities and that tool was always as seen her major tool of diplomacy throughout her life. "Ms.Benazir Bhutto was not only a

[5] Schofield, Victoria. Benazir Bhutto: A great and brave friend. Telegraph December 28, 2007
[6]Haqqani, Husain. Bhutto's legacy.Wall Street Journal. December 28, 2007.
[7]Hillen, Michelle. Arkansas friend calls Bhutto a tireless spirit'. Arkansas Online December 28, 2007.

great leader of Pakistan, but was also a global politician. She had the potential to look into the future."[8]

Benazir tackling Afghan issue after Zia's Demise

On the external front, Benazir will have to deal with the Afghan issue at its final and most crucial stage. Although she has pledged to continue the Afghan policy formulated by her predecessors, she will be faced with a changed situation as the pullout of the Russian troops from Afghanistan will be completed by February 1989. The major choice before the new administration is whether to continue providing arms to the Afghan Mujahedeen operating from Pakistan or to help pave the way for a broad-based government in Kabul.

While it has no choice but to go along with the old policy it may be unhappy to pay the price for it. According to observers the continued arms supply to the Mujahedeen could have severe repercussions, including intensified terror bombings inside Pakistan.

Benazir has so far refrained from committing herself to any position on this. Meanwhile, she has firmly stated that there will not be any shift in the foreign policy of the country and that her government will continue to maintain strong ties with Washington. However, her tilt towards the US may again evoke sharp reactions from the left wing of her party.

Benazir Government Relations with India and South Asian Community

She seems to lay special emphasis on Pakistan's relations with India and other neighboring countries. The SAARC summit meeting in the last week of December will provide her with an opportunity to have a dialogue with Indian Prime Minister Rajiv Gandhi on bilateral issues. She has, of course, made it very clear that the relations with India must be based on mutual respect and sovereign equality.[9]

Unlike some, Bhutto welcomed the strategic partnership the US had formed with India. Sulking and complaining about it like a jilted lover served no purpose. In fact, the stronger the US-India nexus the more it would facilitate Pakistan's own attempts to forge better relations with India and hopefully dissuade it from taking advantage of Pakistan's preoccupations with the Taliban to make mischief in Balochistan and FATA.

In fact, Bhutto did not view India as much a threat to Pakistan as a market for our products; and its burgeoning economy as a source of capital and investment for Pakistan. Indian investments, she believed, would act as a spur to both countries to manage their relations sensibly, and, more importantly, the goodwill and confidence generated would enable the billions spent on defense to be diverted to development.

[8]Kamboh, Akram, Shaheed-e-Jamhooriyat Benazir Bhutto, p-9.
[9]Hussain, Zahid. Pakistan Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto prepares for real problems. India Today December 31, 1988. Updated: November 13, 2013.

Benazir Bhutto Governmental and Post Governmental Thoughts regarding International Relations with Neighboring Countries

As far as her post Governmental perspective is concern Zafer Hilaley explains that:
Energy pipelines to India from Iran and Central Asia across Pakistan were also very much on her mind, so too trade and transit routes. Indeed, Bhutto placed so high a priority on befriending India that the Mumbai attacks happened on her watch, she would have pressed on with her policy of engaging India in the belief that Delhi's anger would abate in due course when no conclusive proof of official Pakistani involvement had been established.

As for Kashmir, Bhutto's position was unequivocal. Both India and Pakistan, she maintained, had in the Shimla Agreement forsworn war as a means of resolving the dispute, consequently, a peaceful settlement was mandatory. If, however, this were not forthcoming, as it was not, both countries would have to live in hope.

Short of forsaking the sacred right of the Kashmiris to determine their own future, Bhutto was open to any and every proposal that would make life easier for them to live, work, travel and trade; and be fully empowered to handle their own affairs singly or jointly with their brethren on the other side of the Line of Control. Her only condition for any arrangement was that it should be acceptable to the Kashmiris. As for the LoC, her goal was to render it as she once mused, us relevant as a line drawn on the seashore at high tide". India and Pakistan, according to Bhutto, had reached the proverbial fork in the road. One road led to confrontation and ultimately to conflict, perhaps a nuclear conflict, while the other held out the prospect of the two countries living as peaceful neighbors cooperating and collaborating whenever possible for mutual benefit.

And with the Taliban knocking at the gates of Peshawar, Bhutto felt the time to choose had come, and for her, the choice was a no-brainer. The promise Bhutto had made in Washington to establish a better relationship with Kabul came to light when, in their meeting in Islamabad on December 27, 2007, Karzai let on, in so many words, that he believed her when she had said that the hostility and mistrust that had hitherto plagued relations between their two countries under Musharraf would end when Bhutto was at the helm of affairs in Pakistan.

Without the cooperation of Iran, Bhutto believed, peace in Afghanistan would remain a chimera. It had been madness to sacrifice good relations with Iran for the sake of the Taliban," Bhutto once told me. Neither Iran's strong relationship with India nor Tehran's diffidence when it came to supporting our stance on Kashmir was reason enough, Bhutto believed, for allowing 60 years to pass without a single pipeline or transmission pole connecting Pakistan to energy-rich Iran. "And who suffered as a result? She asked. "Not Iran."[10]

[10]Hilaly, Zafar. Benazir Bhutto's foreign policy, Pak Tea House Online page. 28.feb.2009. pakteahouse.net/tag/Benazir-bhutto.

The First Reign of Mohtarma:

During her first reign (1988-90), she was also the West's best hope to help close off Pakistan's border region with Afghanistan for use as a safe haven by Islamic militants engaged in a war against the West. For the West, Ms. Bhutto was considered to be the logical vehicle around which to rebuild democracy and to provide greater co-operation for international efforts to root out terrorists in the Afghanistan border region.[11]

During her first premiership, Bhutto went on a number of foreign trips, enhancing her image as the first female Prime Minister in the Islamic world. In these, she sought to attract foreign investment and aid for Pakistan. She also made efforts to cultivate good relationships with the leaders of Islamic countries who had also had good relationships with her father, including Libya's Gaddafi, Abu Dhabi's Sheikh Zayed, and the Saudi royal family. In 1989, she attended the Commonwealth Heads of Government Meeting in Kuala Lumpur, where Pakistan was re-admitted to the Commonwealth of Nations.

That same year, she made an important visit to the U.S. in June, addressing both houses of Congress and giving the commencement speech at Harvard. As Premier Bhutto was reluctant to challenge the ISI's support for the Islamist mujahedeen forces in Afghanistan which were then engaged in a civil war against the country's Marxist-Leninist government. Bhutto initially attempted to improve relations with neighboring India, harking back to the Shimla Accords. She invited Indian Prime Minister Rajiv Gandhi and his wife Sonia to be her guests for a three-day visit in Islamabad following the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation summit.

Rajiv returned on a bilateral visit six months later. The two countries agreed to reduce their military levels along the border and agreed not to attack their respective nuclear installations. Bhutto claimed that she terminated support for Sikh separatists active in Indian something which Zia had encouraged to destabilize Indian control in Punjab.[12]

But few of the peoples don't confirm Bhatiyia’s claims regarding delivering such any list to India. After being accused of being soft on India, she looks a harder line against them, particularly on the Kashmir conflict. Amid growing Kashmiri protests against Indian rule, in interviews, Bhutto expressed support for the Kashmiri Muslim community. She called on the United Nations to oversee the Kashmir plebiscite originally promised in 1948.

The Second Reign of Mohtarma:

Benazir Bhutto, after spending three years, as an opposition leader, was re-elected as a Prime Minister of Pakistan on 19th October 1993, while pledging to promote, to strengthen politics as well as tolerance in the country.[13]After the elections, strange situation swelled. Delay in transfer of power, various speculations and objections were actually nothing but an attempt to keep Benazir Bhutto out of power." Religious parties opened a debate on a new issue

[11]World plunged deeper into crisis. The Australian December 29, 2007.
[12]Bhatia, Shyam (2008), Goodbye Shahzadi: A Political Biography of Benazir Bhutto. Lotus Collection.
[13]Ziring, 1993, p. 1175-1185

regarding objections to women's rule, although the religious class had earlier made their decision against Ayub Khan during the election of Fatima Jinnah by supporting him. But now the same religious class was raising objections to Benazir Bhutto being made prime minister.[14]That was the attitude that Ms. Benazir Bhutto faced all the years. What was right for her till yesterday was wrong for Ms. Benazir Bhutto today and what was wrong for Ms. Benazir Bhutto yesterday how can she be right for her today?After all the attempts, the pretexts and attempts to keep Ms. Benazir Bhutto away from the prime minister's great position, she was finally invited to rule.AfterbeingnominatedasPrimeMinister,Ms.Benazir Bhutto soon got a vote of confidence fromtheNationalAssembly.158 assembly members voted for him. Thus, the democracy vehicle which was sent off forcibly by martial law of 1977 again departed for its destination.[15]

She was much pragmatic to understand neighboring reality when In September 1996, the Taliban secured power in Afghanistan. Bhutto's government was one of only three countries to recognize it as the legitimate Afghan government, a move that further distanced it from its Western allies. She made diplomatic relations with North Korea Government as far as for the betterment of Pakistan need for missile system was concerned the Pakistani Administration believed that they needed an equivalent launch pad system for their nuclear warheads.

They decided to make a deal with the North Korean government; exchanging information about enrichment for missile technology, Bhutto later claimed that on her 1993 visit to kores, she secretly carried CD containing nuclear data, although she subsequently retracted this claim.[16]

We see that definitely diplomacy is weapon of securing countries aim and objective communication in the way she never openly confessed that Pakistan is a nuclear state and Pakistan had any such technological relations with any state like China and North Korea. So, in this sense she shrouded diplomatically Pakistan a nuclear program diplomat by not accepting any nuclear progress bot to divert west toward her government to disseminate the message of western values like women rights, human rights, concreting of democracy.

The words of Queen Elizabeth I could well have been hers when she declared, "I know I have the body of a weak and feeble woman, but have the heart and stomach of a king, and the king of England too".
When the final curtain falls, we will look back of her life in the immortal words of Keats:
But I have lived and not lived in vain;
My mind may lose its force;
My blood its fire:
And my frame perishes even in conquering pain:
But there is that within me;
Which shall tire, torture and time

[14]Anjum Murtza, Bhutto Khandaan Shahaadton Ka Safar, p-160.
[15]Yazdani Khalid, From Benazir Bhutto to Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, p-82.
[16]Allen, Brooke (2016). Benazir Bhutto: Favored Daughter, Icon Series, New York: Amazon-pp.116.

And breathe when I expire",
So, farewell to you Benazir, our beloved shade.
Sleep well.

Women, Islam and Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto:

The period of Ms. Benazir Bhutto was a period of development for Pakistani women. The People's Party encouraged women to come into politics. Begum Naseem Jahan, founding member of the party, encouraged educated women to go door to door to convey the message of the party. The party also created a wing of women, which encouraged women more. In 1972, the doors of all government jobs were opened to women. For the first time, vice chancellor of universities, provinces the first time women in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs got jobs. The United Nations declared 1975 as the World Year of Women. The first women's world conference was held in Mexico. The Pakistani delegation was led by Nusrat Bhutto, as a result of the proposals presented at the conference, which led to the establishment of the Women's Division in 1976.[17]

Women have always been a very lifelike subject in Pakistani society. A history of pride, as well as a sense of repute and pride, cannot be separated or ignored at any moment in any case. When a woman does not have a place in this so-called male society, does she not have any importance in herself. There is no importance to her. The up building of knowledge rebellion against dictatorship is what makes Benazir Bhutto "unabated"by the anti-cruelty. Sri Lanka had the honor of being the world's first female Prime Minister in 1960. She was the heir to the power and politics of her husband Solomon Bandra Naik. Prime Minister Bandra Naik was killed in 1959; he was the founder of the Party of The Kingdom. After the assassination of the husband, the Party of India accepted Shri Mao as its leader and offered the presidency which he had not accepted as a cloudy one.[18]Shri Mao Bandra Naik undoubtedly had the privilege of being the first woman Prime Minister, but the honour of being the first woman Prime Minister of the Muslim world got by Ms. Benazir Bhutto in 1988.

After that, although Tanso Challer in Turkey and Hasina Wajid and Begum Khalida Zia in Bangladesh were also prime ministers of Muslim countries, none of the three women could not take away the unique respect from Ms. Benazir Bhutto.[19] The life of Ms. Benazir Bhutto had not been reduced to challenges, problems and difficulties. When she took the oath as a prime minister, a few Egyptians and other muftis (Religious Clerics) gave a fatwa that a woman cannot be prime minister. Some also left the rumors that saluting a woman is against man’s bravery. At that time Fatima Vensi proved that there had been heads of state in Muslim history. Benazir being prime minister is in accordance with the Islamic jurisprudence.[20]

[17]Daily Jang, Karachi, 4 August 2017, p-6.
[18]Adeeb, Humayon, Ziya K Baad (After Ziya), p-209.
[19]Awaan Fazal Hussain, Shaheed-e-Jamhooriyat Ka Qatil Kon, p-123.
[20]Nizami, Qayoom, Shahaadat Se Shahaadat Tak, P-233.

A military general said, "I consider it an insult to salute a woman. Sadly, these generals considered it an insult to a constitutional and democratic prime minister, but surrendering and saluting to General Arora of India as if it was a place of honor for him. So, the Chairperson of the Pakistan People's Party, despite his democratic and constitutional victory, her prime minister's oath of office was kept for several days.[21] Organization of Islamic Countries (OIC) cancelled the membership of Pakistan just because of Pakistani people had chosen a female as a Prime minister, which was successfully failed by Ms. Benazir Bhutto. The scholars declared the rule of woman invalid and un-Islamic, including that of prominent Saudi cleric Sheikh Baz, who was a blind but distinguished.

During the election campaigns the Bhutto voiced it concern for women's social and health issues including the issue of discrimination against women. Bhutto announced plans to establish women's police stations, Courts and women's Development Banks.[22] In Zia-ul-Haq's dictatorship and subsequent democratic periods, Ms. Benazir Bhutto always used to talk about women. She worked to address the prejudice staked by various ethnic groups against women. She knew that women could play a positive and constructive role in society." During her campaign, she raised her voice for women's rights and made women police stations. Women were made judges in high courts. Ms. Majida Rizvi Sahiba was honoured to become the first female judge of Sindh high court.

The Women Development Ministry had women study centers in five universities- Islamabad, Karachi, Quetta, Peshawar and Lahore but four of them could not be functional due to non-financial and administrative support and only the Centre of Karachi University was established in 1989. The first women's bank was also established in 1989, which was aimed at working on the financial needs of women, so the nationalized commercial bank was given the status of a development financial institution as well as a social welfare organization. It was run by women and Ithasthirty-eight branches working across the country. Initially, it was also funded by the Ministry of Development for small loans towomen.[23]

The government of Ms. Benazir Bhutto Shaheed appointed Fakharunisa Khokhar as the first female judge in the Lahore High Court. During the ten-year high court judge she was about to become the Chief Justice of the High Court, but "Musharraf's thinking" worked and she retired and contested the High Court bar and became president.Lateron,she reached intheNationalAssembly.[24]Ms. Benazir Bhutto was a symbol of not only the Federation of Pakistan but also a manifestation of the people's movements." She was a great feminist. Today, women are being raped in Pakistan. They are being factually abused. In 1996, a woman was left in a hearth to be stalled. She took a strong notice of the incident; she sent the woman abroad with millions of rupees for her treatment.[25]

[21]Gurdaspuri Aslam, Shaheed Bibi Ki Dastaan Aur Meri Jidojahed p-634.
[22] Dr. Rajkumar_Pakistan peoples party Zulfikar Ali Bhutto to Benazir Bhutto, p-165
[23]Mehnaz Rehman, Daily Jung, Karachi, 4th August 2017, p-15.
[24]Mazhar Birlas, Loot Brae Siysat, Daily Jung, 17th July 2018, p-14.
[25]Bashir Riaz, Rafaqat Ka Safar Benazir Yaaden, p-286.

News of differences in the Bhutto family began with Meer Murtaza Bhutto's decision to contest the elections. Afew things have come to the notice of events that have been reported from that time. First, if Mir Murtaza Bhutto's aim was to simply return to the country and to have a place for himself in politics here, it was his fundamental right that no one could have deprived him of. Indeed, the path that Mr. Murtaza Bhutto took to achieve this goal and the atmosphere that he established with his statements could have been resistant to his purposes. During this time, most of the steps of Mr. Murtaza Bhutto were not even the best political burdens. For example, he initially decided that he had to do politics at Sindh level. However, if he was aclaim to the political legacy of late Prime Minister Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, he should have introduced himself into national politics. Mir MurtazaBhutto's second decision was to run from 27 seats in the National and Provincial Assemblies, which gave the impression of having astrong political perception of them.

Every few that after the start of the election process, he had to give up contesting several seats one by one, but on the day of the election he was a candidate in many seats. The absence of asufficient number of political workers would be aware of the political advantage that could have been achieved by the presence of such a number of seats. To acommon man, it was nothing but meaningless adventure. The biggest mistake that came from Mr. Bhutto was her contesting from constituencies where the People's Party candidates were not only standing but also with strong positions. His move and his decision not to contest from any constituency from where he would have faced a strong opposition from the People's Party helped spread the impression that his main aim was to harm the People's Party. His failure in all other seats except one provincial seat in the election highlighted his decision-making ability. Even after the elections, Mr. Murtaza Bhutto has been facing the People's Party, which he does not like to join himself, and he also believes his right to express his confidence in the leaders present and to change his policies.[26]

Thenewsofassassination ofMohtarma Benazir Bhutto spread like fire in the jungle.Onthisoccasion, the country and foreign media tried to find out the impact on this tragic incident. Mian Nawaz Sharif, after Benazir Bhutto was martyred, immediately rushed to general hospital Rawalpindi, where he saw the body of Benazir Bhutto, and started crying and could not speak to them. Mian Nawaz Sharif looked very sad on this occasion. On the same night Mian Muhammad Nawaz Sharif announced a full strike on Friday 28 December next day against boycott of general elections. He called an All-Parties Conference (APC) on killing of Benazir Bhutto and demanded that national government be formed by consensus of all parties, President Musharraf resigned, conduct general elections in accordance with the new Sovereign Election Commission and new rules, do not ask the present government to inquire into the attack on Benazir Bhutto as we have them.[27]

[26]Dr. Syed Jafar Ahmed, Trial of Democracy, p-184.185
[27]AwanFazal Hussain, Shaheed-e-Jamhooriyat Ka Qatil Kaun, p-15,16.

Assassination of Benazir Bhutto

However, Benazir Bhutto not only confronted with political challenges, dictatorial regime and hardships in her struggle for restoration and strengthening democracy in Pakistan but also faced male chauvinistic politics, orthodox religious Ulamas, entrenched military and bureaucratic elites which were hostile to her father's political legacy.[28] Benazir Bhutto became the victim of Zia's revengeful oppressive approach towards Bhutto family. However, Z.A. Bhutto's martyrdom raised level of sympathy among masses and also enhanced the political credential of Benazir Bhutto. She exhibited pragmatic approach as a chairperson of PPP and de-radicalized the party. Thus, she transformed the Pakistan People's Party from its socialistic rhetoric towards liberal disposition.[29] The assassination of Benazir Bhutto is the sequence of his father's hanging. When People's Party sources said that Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto had actually been the victim of the wrath of the United States of America because he had launched the nuclear program in Pakistan and was enthusiastic for the unity of the Muslim countries. Several international leaders pressured General Zia-ul- Haq to stop execution of Bhutto.

So,on4 April1979, for the first time in the country's history, a Prime Minister was hanged.[30] The fourth murder of the Bhutto family was Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto, daughter of Shaheed Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto and twice prime minister of the country. Benazir Bhutto was assassinated on 27 December 2007 on her return from a successful election meeting at Liaqat Bagh in Rawalpindi. The daughter of ZulfiqarAli Bhutto is the fourth member of her family to be killed. Although the Pakistani government is re-insinuating Al-Qaeda and the Taliban for her murder, sources in the department are not ready to accept this[31].

Earlier, when Ms. Benazir Bhutto ended her eight-year exile and returned home, she was given a historic and a very friendly welcome by millions of people at Karachi Airport. And when his caravan left the airport and reached at Karsaz, two bombs were blasted and bullets were fired. In this attack, Ms. Benazir Bhutto miraculously survived, but more than 150 people of her party were killed and more than 400 injured. If considered, the similarism of some things in the assassination of Benazir Bhutto's brother Shaheed Mir Murtaza Bhutto and the conspiracy to kill Ms. Benazir Bhutto at Karsaz on October 18, 2007 cannot be merely a coincidence. As the night time attack and mysterious shutdown of street lights may not be acoincidence.[32]

Assassination of Benazir Bhutto and the Role of Musharaf Government

When Benazir Bhutto decided to end her deportation and return to her country, Pakistan, she was stopped from various ways and means to not come to Pakistan in any case. Because their

[28] Ahmad, 2005, p. 20-21; Suvorova, 2015, p. 9-10.
[29]*Pakistan Observer*, December, 27, 2017
[30]Javed Aazhar, Maut Mery Taaqub Me, p-123,124.

[31]Awan Fazal Hussain, Shaheed-e-Jamhooriyat Ka Qatil Kaun, p-218.
[32] Ibid

lives are in danger and if they go back to Pakistan they will be martyred. But Ms. Benazir Bhutto heard of no one, and she ended her exile and returned home for the sake of the strengthening of the poor people and democracy of this country. While Ms. Benazir Bhutto's return home was given a life-less welcome from the people of this country on October 18, 2007, the terrorists tried to warn and block her path by suicide bombings after another as her rally reached at the site of Karsaz with "Karwan-e- Democracy". She miraculously survived the attack. It was the beginning of the return of Benazir Bhutto to Pakistan and her wonderful reception from the people as well as the terrorists' plans to kill Benazir Bhutto.

As Ms. Benazir Bhutto knew that her life was under threat and that anti-democracy, anti-people and anti-national forces wanted to kill her, the people had a certain hope for her excellence. She was the symbol of federation, the destiny of this country and the sufferings of the poor people and the greatest daughter and a guardian of democracy. At the same time, those who conspired against and killed her, knew that she would not stop, bow down, nor sit in the house of fear of such attacks. It was akind of war,friends and enemies all were waiting for her strategies.

Ms. Benazir Bhutto fought this battle with courage and immense enthusiasm, with a blind eye to death. While challenging the enemies, she died with a great glory. There was no serious attempt by the government to identify and expose those involved in conspiracy behind the assassination of Benazir Bhutto. It can be determined by the government's action to wash the spot immediately with water and erase evidences.Different opinions were given about hermurder. After the eradication of evidences, the Question arises, Who Was theMurderer? The government clearly continued to hold the Taliban and al-Qaeda responsible for such atragedy. At one point, President Pervez Musharraf himself held Benazir Bhutto responsible for the killing while the finger of the people was raised to the government. Asif Ali Zardari clearly called the Muslim League Q, 'The Killer League'. Foreign and domestic analysts continued to express their views. Former Army Chief Mirza Aslam Baig openly declared America responsible. The opinion of think tanks in India and many other countries was the same.[33]The government put all responsibility for the incident on al-Qaeda and Baitullah Mahsood and declared them the murderer of Benazir Bhutto.

[33] Ibid

References

Encarta English Dictionary.CD. Edition.2102. Key word: Diplomacy.

Panhwar Sani Hussain (ED) Articles Written to Pay Tribute to Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto. Panhwar.pp:9,10: January:6.2008.

Panhwar Sani Hussain (ED). Democracy must be Benazir Bhutto's lasting memorial.by. Gordon Brown December 31, 2007.pp:13-14.

Islam, Tariq Islam. Not having lived in vain. Daily Dawn.khi. January 1,2008.

Schofield, Victoria. Benazir Bhutto: A great and brave friend. Telegraph December 28, 2007.

Haqqani, Husain. Bhutto's legacy.Wall Street Journal. December 28, 2007.

Hillen, Michelle. Arkansas friend calls Bhutto a tireless spirit'. Arkansas Online December 28, 2007.

Kamboh, Akram, Shaheed-e-Jamhooriyat Benazir Bhutto, p-9.

Hussain, Zahid. Pakistan Prime Minister Benazir Bhutto prepares for real problems. India Today December 31, 1988. Updated: November 13, 2013.

Hilaly, Zafar. Benazir Bhutto's foreign policy, Pak Tea House Online page. 28.feb.2009. pakteahouse.net/tag/Benazir-bhutto.

World plunged deeper into crisis. The Australian December 29, 2007.

Bhatia, Shyam (2008), Goodbye Shahzadi: A Political Biography of Benazir Bhutto. Lotus Collection.

Ziring, 1993, p. 1175-1185.

Anjum Murtza, Bhutto Khandaan Shahaadton Ka Safar, p-160.

Yazdani Khalid, From Benazir Bhutto to Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, p-82.

Allen, Brooke (2016). Benazir Bhutto: Favored Daughter, Icon Series, New York: Amazon-pp.116.

Daily Jang, Karachi, 4 August 2017, p-6.

Adeeb, Humayon, Ziya K Baad (After Ziya), p-209.

Awaan Fazal Hussain, Shaheed-e-Jamhooriyat Ka Qatil Kon, p-123.

Nizami, Qayoom, Shahaadat Se Shahaadat Tak, P-233.

Gurdaspuri Aslam, Shaheed Bibi Ki Dastaan Aur Meri Jidojahed p-634.

Dr. Rajkumar_Pakistan peoples party Zulfikar Ali Bhutto to Benazir Bhutto, p-165.

Mehnaz Rehman, Daily Jung, Karachi, 4th August 2017, p-15.

Mazhar Birlas, Loot Brae Siysat, Daily Jung, 17th July 2018, p-14.

Bashir Riaz, Rafaqat Ka Safar Benazir Yaaden, p-286.

Dr. Syed Jafar Ahmed, Trial of Democracy, p-184.185.

Awan Fazal Hussain, Shaheed-e-Jamhooriyat Ka Qatil Kaun, p-15,16.

Ahmad, 2005, p. 20-21; Suvorova, 2015, p. 9-10.

Pakistan Observer, December, 27, 2017.

Javed Aazhar, Maut Mery Taaqub Me, p-123,124.

Awan Fazal Hussain, Shaheed-e-Jamhooriyat Ka Qatil Kaun, p-218.

Ibid.

Ibid.

Dr. Summer Sultana is Chairperson and Professor in Department of Political Science**,** University of Karachi.

Bashir Ahmed Kalwar is Ph.D Scholar in Area Study Centre for Europe, University of Karachi.

Dr. Muhammad Ali Junaid, Department of Political Science**,** University of Karachi**.**